

**EXAMINER'S REPORT****("Examiner's Report")**

<b>Contracting Authority:</b>	<b>Správa železnic, státní organizace,</b> Dlážděná 1103/7 110 00 Prague 1  ID No.: 709 94 234
<b>Name of the Design Competition:</b>	<b>Centrála Správy železnic</b>

**A. Introduction:**

1. On 29 September 2020, the Contracting Authority launched, by sending out an announcement of the design competition for publication in the Public Contract Journal, a one-stage open architectural competition for design entitled "**Správa železnic Headquarters**" (the "**Competition**") submitted pursuant to Section 143 et seq. of Act No. 143/2016 Sb., on Public Procurement, as amended (the "**PPA**") and in accordance with the Czech Chamber of Architects' competition rules dated 24 April 1993, as amended (the "**CCA Competition Rules**").
2. On 15 February 2021, the representative of the organiser of the Competition handed over the competition entries to the competition entries' reviewer for review, namely in the following scope:
  - 1) in paper form:
    - graphical part of the competition entries
  - 2) in electronic form:
    - graphical part of the competition entries in .pdf format;
    - drawings documentation in .dwg format;
    - text part of the competition entries in .pdf format.
3. The examiner of the competition entries ("**reviewer**") accepted the competition entries of the individual participants within the abovementioned scope and subsequently between 15 February and 12 March 2021 performed the review of the competition entries, with the result of the competition entries' review being credibly recorded in this Examiner's Report, which is to be subsequently provided and presented to the competition jury at its evaluation meeting.
4. The reviewer states that he has performed the examination of the competition entries of individual participants in both paper and electronic form. Given that the reviewer was informed by the representative of the Competition organizer that the jury evaluation meeting will take place on March 16 - 18, 2021 in online form, in accordance with the explanation of the competition terms and conditions (the "**Competition Terms and Conditions**") published by the Contracting Authority in set no. 5, the electronic form of the competition entries is decisive. Any findings stated in Examiner's report if these relate only to examination of the competition entries in paper form are marked as "NON-RELEVANT" and the jury will not vote on these facts during the jury's evaluation meeting.

B. Examiner’s Report

REVIEW OF THE GRAPHICAL PART OF THE COMPETITION ENTRIES – PANELS – FORMAL PART

	Reviewed Fact No. 1 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 2 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 3 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 4 (recommended)	Reviewed Fact No. 5 (recommended)
Competition Entry No.	The graphical part of the competition entries is submitted in Czech, or in English with translation of a descriptive parts into Czech due to clause 13.1.2 of the Competition Terms and Conditions	The competition entries do not show any signs of violation of the requirement to maintain the anonymity of the competition entries	The competition entry contains a maximum of 6 pieces of panels	Panels submitted in B1 panel size, vertical (portrait) orientation	<b>Layout of the panels:</b> <b>Panel No. 1</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Annotation of the competition entry and an extract from the text report</li><li>- Brief description of the selected architectural, urbanistic, operating, layout, structural, energy and material solution of the facility</li><li>- Plotting in a 3D model (view from Vyšehrad; P07.4)</li><li>- Plotting in a 3D model (view from Dívčí hrady; P07.3)</li><li>- Layout having the recommended scale of 1:600 (P04)</li><li>- Drawing of wider context having the recommended scale of 1:10000</li><li>- Drawing of wider context having the recommended scale of 1:2500</li></ul> <b>Panel No. 2</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Bird’s eye view – plotted in the model (P07.2)</li><li>- Completed area table (sample P13)</li><li>- Other sketches, diagrams and charts explaining the design</li><li>- Detail of façade skin in section and on the plan in the scale of 1:20</li></ul> <b>Panel No. 3</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Plans of above-ground floors having the recommended scale of 1:600</li></ul> <b>Panel No. 4</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Other plans, orthogonal views and sections having the recommended scale of 1:600</li></ul> <b>Panel No. 5-6</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Visualisation of the design (using any graphical technique): at least 4 three-dimensional images of the exteriors (view from Nádražní street from south-east, view from Nádražní street from north-east, view from a platform of the Smíchov railway station, view from Dobříšská street from south-west)</li><li>- Visualisation of the design (using any graphical technique): at least 2 three-dimensional images of the interior (lobby, large HUB)</li></ul>
1	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
2	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
3	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
4	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
5	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
6	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
7	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
8	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
9	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

<b>10</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>11</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>12</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>13</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>14</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>15</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>16</b>	YES	YES	YES	NOTE	NOTE
<b>17</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>18</b>	NOTE	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>19</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>20</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>21</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>22</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>23</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>24</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>25</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>26</b>	NOTE	YES	YES	NOTE	NOTE
<b>27</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>28</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>29</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>30</b>	YES	YES	YES	NOTE	YES
<b>31</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE
<b>32</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>33</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>34</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	NOTE

Reviewer's Notes to the graphic part of the competition proposals examination		
	Reviewed Fact No.:	Reviewer's Note:
Competition Entry No. 1	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a view from the platform of the Smíchov station.
Competition Entry No. 2	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans, sections and views at a scale of 1:650.
Competition Entry No. 6	4	The situation on panel 1 of the graphic part of the competition entry is not displayed in the recommended scale of 1:600.
Competition Entry No. 8	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains horizontal views and sections at a scale of 1:700.
Competition Entry No. 14	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans, sections and views at a scale of 1:650.
	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a view from Nádražní street, from north-east.
Competition Entry No. 15	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans, sections and views at a scale of 1:500.
Competition Entry No. 16	3	<b>NOT-RELEVANT:</b> the graphic part in paper form – panels presented in A3 format; it is not relevant in view of the fact that the subject of the evaluation in the competition entry in electronic form
	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a detail of the facade cladding in section and floor plan.
Competition Entry No. 17	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans, sections and views at a scale of 1:500.
Competition Entry No. 18	1	Keys and descriptions of the graphic part submitted only in English without translation into Czech
Competition Entry No. 19	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a drawing of broader relations at a scale of 1:10000.
Competition Entry No. 20	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a completed table of areas.
	4	The detail of the facade cladding on panel 2 is displayed at a scale of 1:100.
	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a view from Nádražní street, from north-east.
Competition Entry No. 22	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans, sections and views at a scale of 1:750 and 1:400.
Competition Entry No. 23	4	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain floor plans of the 4th–6th above-ground floors.
Competition Entry No. 24	4	The graphic part of the competition entry contains floor plans of the underground floors at a scale of 1:750.

<b>Competition Entry No. 25</b>	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain the situation at a scale of 1:600.
<b>Competition Entry No. 26</b>	<b>1</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry is mostly submitted only in English without translation of the descriptive parts into Czech.
	<b>3</b>	<b>NOT-RELEVANT:</b> the graphic part in paper form – panels presented in A3 format; it is not relevant in view of the fact that the subject of the evaluation in the competition entry in electronic form. After the deadline for the competition entries submission, the graphic part was delivered to the contracting authority in paper form in an even larger format – again irrelevant with regard to the fact that the subject of the evaluation is the competition entry in electronic form.
	<b>4</b>	Sections and view displayed in axonometric view; drawings are not at a scale of 1:600.
<b>Competition Entry No. 27</b>	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a detail of the facade cladding in the floor plan.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain floor plans of the underground floors.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain 1 spatial visualisation of the interior.
<b>Competition Entry No. 28</b>	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a detail of the facade cladding in the floor plan.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry contains sections at a scale of 1:300.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a view from Nádražní street, from south-east.
<b>Competition Entry No. 29</b>	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a drawing of broader relations at a scale of 1:2500.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry contains a cross-section at a scale of 1:300.
<b>Competition Entry No. 30</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>NOT-RELEVANT:</b> the graphic part in paper form – panels presented in A3 and A4 format; it is not relevant because the subject of the evaluation in the competition entry in electronic form.
<b>Competition Entry No. 31</b>	<b>4</b>	Drawing of broader relations displayed at a scale of 1:20000.
	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry contains a detail of the facade cladding at a scale of 1:10.
	<b>4</b>	Floor plans of the underground floors displayed at a scale of 1:1200, sections displayed at a scale of 1:300.
	<b>4</b>	The spatial visualisation of the interior showing the entrance foyer is missing.
<b>Competition Entry No. 34</b>	<b>4</b>	The graphic part of the competition entry does not contain a drawing of broader relations at a scale of 1:10000.

## REVIEW OF THE BINDING REQUIREMENTS UNDER CLAUSE 2.4.2 OF THE COMPETITION TERMS AND CONDITIONS

	Reviewed Fact No. 1	Reviewed Fact No. 2	Reviewed Fact No. 3	Reviewed Fact No. 4	Reviewed Fact No. 5
Competition Entry No.	a) the location of the terminal access ramp and its clearance dimensions under the Regulation (P06);	b) not to spatially interfere with the structures of the station, metro tunnels and metro protection system ("MPS"), except for the expected alterations to ventilation shafts;	c) not to spatially interfere with the load-bearing structure of the underground car park that is structurally connected to the MPS through the shared ceiling structure;	d) to preserve the additional entry chamber (AEC) that must be situated in non-collapsible space, and to adjust the height and the location of the proposed facility accordingly;	e) point 19 of the Regulation (P06) entitled "Axis of outside track".
1	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
2	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
3	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
4	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
5	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
6	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
7	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
8	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
9	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
10	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
11	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
12	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
13	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
14	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
15	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
16	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
17	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
18	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
19	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
20	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
21	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

<b>22</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>23</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>24</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>25</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>26</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>27</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>28</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>29</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>30</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>31</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>32</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>33</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>34</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

## REVIEW OF THE TEXT PART OF THE COMPETITION ENTRIES

	Reviewed Fact No. 1 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 2 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 3 (binding)	Reviewed Fact No. 4 (recommended)	Reviewed Fact No. 5 (recommended)
Competition Entry No.	The text part of the competition entries is submitted in Czech, or in English with translation into Czech due to clause 13.1.2 of the Competition Terms and Conditions	The text part does not show any signs of violation of the requirement to maintain the anonymity of the competition entries	The text part is presented on 15 pages of text (in case of English language and Czech translation, may be double)	The text part is presented in A4 format, vertical (portrait) orientation, Verdana font, font size 10	TEXT REPORT contains: - preview of panel 1; - non-binding bid price for the performance of the Ensuing Contract (per annex P14); - an annotation of the competition entry (recommended length of approximately 1000 characters including spaces); - the text report itself
1	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
2	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
3	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
4	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
5	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
6	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
7	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
8	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
9	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
10	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
11	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
12	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
13	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
14	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
15	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
16	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
17	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
18	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
19	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES



<b>20</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>21</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>22</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>23</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>24</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>25</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>26</b>	NOTE	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>27</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>28</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>29</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>30</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>31</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>32</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>33</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
<b>34</b>	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

Reviewer's Notes to the text part of the competition proposals examination		
	Reviewed Fact No.:	Reviewer's Note:
<b>Competition Entry No. 26</b>	1	In the text part of the competition entry, one of the paragraphs is submitted only in English without translation into Czech.

<b>Ing. arch. Tomáš Zdvihal</b>	reviewer	
---------------------------------	----------	--